

## **Court Decision Increases Design Duty to Third Parties**

*Article provided by Professional Liability  
Agents Network (PLAN)*

*The following material is provided for informational purposes only. Before taking any action that could have legal or other important consequences, speak with a qualified professional who can provide guidance that considers your own unique circumstances. This newsletter is based on a white paper written by David A. Ericksen, a principal shareholder in and immediate past President of the law firm of Severson & Werson in San Francisco, California. David leads the firm's Construction and Environmental Practices.*

On July 3, 2014, the California Supreme Court issued its highly anticipated decision in the matter of *Beacon Residential Community Association v. Skidmore, Owings, & Merrill, LLP* (Opinion No. S208173). The underlying claim involved a 595-unit condominium project in San Francisco. The developer treated the project as for-rent apartments for two years before selling units to the public. After the units were sold, the condo owner's association complained of water infiltration, cracked drywall, inadequate firewall separation and -- most importantly -- solar heat gain, which made some units periodically uninhabitable. The solar heat gain was allegedly due to a combination of value engineering decisions, some by the owner without design team objection and some by the design team itself. A claim was filed against the designers.

The San Francisco Trial Court held that absent property damage or a direct contractual relationship, the architects owed no direct duty to the condominium owners for the claimed damages. Unfortunately, the victory was short lived. First the California Court of Appeals and then the California Supreme Court dis-

agreed. The California Supreme Court held:

*[A]n architect owes a duty of care to future homeowners in the design of a residential building where . . . the architect is the principal architect on the project - that is, the architect, in providing professional design services, is not subordinate to other professionals.*

By this holding, the California Supreme Court has opened the door for design professional liability to third parties for purely economic damages even where there is no contractual relationship and no property damage or bodily injuries. The Court did so



even though Skidmore's agreement expressly disclaimed the existence of any "third-party beneficiary of the obligations contained in the Agreement."

### **How Could This Happen?**

Prior to this decision, the prevailing law in California under the economic loss rule held that design professionals had no duty (and therefore no liability) to third parties in the absence of a contractual relationship and/or actual property damage or bodily injuries. The architects in the Beacon Residential project even sought to establish those boundaries by expressly

*Court Decision (continued on page 2)*

(continued from page 1) Court Decision

disclaiming and disavowing the existence of any third party rights or benefits from the obligations contained in the agreement. The Supreme Court observed that despite this clause, the architects provided services “knowing that the finished product would be sold as condominiums.” Drawing principally on the history of products liability cases, the Court stated,

*Although liability for the supply of goods and services historically required privity of contract between the supplier and the injured party, the significance of privity has greatly eroded over the past century. . . The declining significance of privity has found its way into construction law.*

In the end, the *Beacon Residential* decision addresses only a single issue -- a design profession-



al's duty to third parties, particularly those who are the ultimate “consumers” of the end-product of their services. However, this is incredibly significant in that duty is the first and most limiting of the four elements of a claim of professional negligence. A professional negligence claim generally requires a showing of duty, breach of the standard of care, causation, and damages. Duty has historically been the key point of containment and control. As the *Beacon Residential* decision even observed, “Courts . . . have invoked the concept of duty to limit generally ‘the potentially infinite liability which would follow from every negligent act.’ (Quoting *Bily v. Arthur Young*.)

## Six Factors Create Third Party Duty

In evaluating whether such a third-party duty exists, California Courts weigh and balance six factors as previously set forth by the Court in *Biakanja v. Irving* (1958). Those six factors are:

1. Extent intended to affect claimant;
2. Foreseeability of harm to claimant;
3. Certainty that injury was suffered;
4. Closeness of connection between conduct and injury;
5. Moral blame; and
6. Policy of preventing future harm.

Not all six factors need to be present for a duty to exist. They simply need to establish enough weight to tip the Court's judgment to find a duty.

The alleged facts are therefore critical. As alleged by the condominium owners and noted by the Supreme Court, the architects allegedly agreed to provide “full architecture and engineering”, “construction administration”, and “construction contract management”, and in doing so actually attended weekly jobsite meetings and provided complete design oversight and inspections for compliance throughout construction. As the Supreme Court noted several times, the architects were well compensated for doing so with a fee of \$5M.

The architects argued they had no duty to the owners' association on the grounds that they made only recommendations, and all final decisions were by the owner/developer. The Supreme Court concluded that based on the allegations:

*[The architects] applied their specialized skill and professional judgment throughout the construction process to ensure that it would proceed according to approved designs. The work [the architects] performed does not resemble ‘a broadly phrased professional opinion based on a necessarily confined examination’ of client-provided information, nor did [the architects] act merely as ‘suppliers of information for the use and benefit of others.’*

Consistent with the Court's references to historic products liability cases, the status and comparative power and sophistication of the unit purchasers was a major factor in the Court's decision. As it said:

(continued on page 3) Court Decision

(continued from page 2) Court Decision

*The average homebuyer is more akin to the 'presumptively powerless consumer ... The usual buyer of a home is ill-equipped with experience or financial means to discern structural defects ...*

## A Six Step Strategy

True, the *Beacon* decision only had direct and immediate consequences in California. But it's no secret that what starts in California doesn't always stay in California. Therefore, it is wise for all design firms to take steps to prevent assuming a design duty to third parties. Here is a six-step strategy:

### **Continue Using the Intended Beneficiary Clause.**

The architects in *Beacon* expressly excluded third-party beneficiaries as a part of their agreement with the developer. Nevertheless, the Supreme Court disregarded that disclaimer for these claims. The easy response would be to simply abandon the use of an intended beneficiary clause. Don't! Disclaimers of third-party beneficiary clauses will still be enforceable in many situations and jurisdictions. Accordingly, you should double down with a clause to be mirrored in both the contract and in the design documents, such as:

***Consultant's services and work product are intended for the sole use and benefit of Client and are not intended to create any third-party rights or benefits or for any use by any other person or entity or for any other purpose.***

**Draft a Closed and Limited Scope of Services.** In *Beacon*, the Supreme Court was heavily influenced by the architects' allegedly comprehensive scope of services. Design and construction professionals should employ a detailed scope of work that avoids open-ended or ambiguous obligations or result-oriented duties that are more akin to the delivery of a product than a service. With that detailed scope of work in place, "close it" by expressly disclaiming extra-contractual services with a clause such as:

***Consultant's Services shall be limited to those expressly set forth in this Agreement. Consultant shall have no other obligations or responsibilities for the Project except as agreed to in writing.***

**Assume Limited & Allocated Construction Roles.** The Supreme Court in *Beacon* did not or chose not to

# Risk Management Seminar Series

## Sexual Harassment Prevention Training

Friday, December 5, 2014

7:30am Registration

**8:00am - 10:00am** Program

## First Aid, CPR and AED Training - Get Certified and Be Prepared!

Friday, December 19, 2014

7:30am Registration

**8:00am - 3:30pm** Program

## Reserve Early, Seating is Limited!

To register, click on the 'register now' button in the announcement email, or contact Bethany Mongold at [mongold@cavnac.com](mailto:mongold@cavnac.com) or call 619-744-0540.

*NOTE: Due to the popularity of our seminars and limited space available, we regret we cannot provide refunds or credits with less than 72 hours advance notice of cancellation.*

recognize the distinction between design and construction responsibilities. The Court essentially cast them as an undifferentiated collection of services and thereby made the architects co-responsible for the construction outcomes. To avoid this, the design agreement should clearly differentiate the construction role from design services:

***Owner recognizes that the Contractor and Sub-contractors will be solely in control of the Project site and exclusively responsible for construction means, methods, scheduling, sequencing, job-site safety and compliance with all construction documents and directions from Owner or building officials. Consultant shall not be responsible for construction related damages, losses, costs, or claims, except only to the extent caused by Consultant's sole negligence.***

(continued on page 4) Court Decision

(continued from page 3) Court Decision

**Warn Client of Value Engineering Modifications.**

In *Beacon*, the single issue that seemed to have the greatest impact with the Supreme Court was the heat gain. At its core, this issue arose from multiple programming and “value engineering” modifications that ultimately created a problematic condition in some units. At best, most design professionals regard value engineering as an inevitable evil which leads to a downgrade in the project and a modification out of sequence with the preferred design evolution. Design professional service agreements and scopes of work should prepare the client for the realities of this process. Such an “educational” provision might read:

***Upon the written request or direction of Client, Consultant shall evaluate and advise Client with respect to proposed or requested changes in materials, products, or equipment. Consultant shall be entitled to rely on the accuracy and completeness of the information provided in conjunction with the requested substitution. Client acknowledges that such changes may result in a reduction in the quality and performance of the project and accepts that risk in recognition of the objectives of the change. Accordingly, Consultant shall not be responsible for errors, omissions, or inconsistencies in information by others or in any way resulting from incorporating such substitution into the Project.***

**Seek Contractual Separation.** The *Beacon* Court placed significant emphasis on the “principal” role of the architects. How this will ultimately apply to subconsultants within discrete disciplines remains to be seen. However, for the moment, the more contractually removed from the ultimate claimant, the better. Obviously, that approach will not work for those traditionally placed in the role of a prime consultant. In that capacity, the best solution may be to expressly differentiate the role of subconsultants and to establish direct allocations of responsibility to such subconsultants for such disciplines. Such a provision may read:

***Owner and Consultant have jointly selected subconsultants to Consultant with appropriate qualifications for their designated scope of work, and have required such subconsultants to indemnify Owner and Consultant and to carry appropriate insurance for the Project. Accordingly, Owner agrees that it shall not seek to hold Consultant responsible for errors, omissions, or other wrongful***

***acts of such subconsultants except to the extent of Consultant’s proportionate responsibility for such claims, damages, or losses, or to the extent subconsultants’ insurance and other resources are inadequate to respond to the claim.***

**Recommend Outside Review.** The motivation and rationales for the *Beacon* decision sound almost exclusively in themes of product liability and consumer protection. Essentially, the position is that such private purchasers lack the wherewithal and sophistication to evaluate the project. If so, there clearly are third-party services that can do so. As a means of overcoming this sympathy and disparity, consider working with



the selling developer to recommend and advise the purchaser to seek outside advice. Such a recommendation may provide:

***The purchase of any improved real estate is a significant decision. Construction and equipment standards can and do change over time and the condition of improved property can be impacted by post-construction, operation, maintenance, and repairs. Accordingly, prior to purchase, Purchaser is encouraged to seek a qualified, third-party review of the present condition of the property. ■***

*Can We Be of Assistance?*

*We may be able to help you by providing referrals to consultants, and by providing guidance relative to insurance issues, and even to certain preventives, from construction observation through the development and application of sound human resources management policies and procedures. Please call on us for assistance. We’re a member of the Professional Liability Agents Network (PLAN). We’re here to help.*

# Cavignac & Associates is pleased to support the upcoming "10 BEST DRESSED AWARDS" GALA FUNDRAISER...



Join us! Be part of this year's highly anticipated gala, **Leonard Simpson's 10 Best Dressed Awards**. This evening of giving celebrates extraordinary philanthropists who dress every day with *Gloves of Compassion and a Coat of Courage*®. The evening features an awards ceremony, formal seated dinner, theatrical show, dancing and auction. Proceeds from this event will benefit **Dress for Success San Diego**, a non-profit organization focused on empowering disadvantaged women to succeed in job interviews, thrive in the workplace, build careers and improve the quality of life for their families.

**THEME:** "A Moment in Time"

**HOSTED BY:** Leonard Simpson of TV's Fashion Forward  
Sally B. Thornton, Founding Chair  
Kelly Emberg, Honorary Chair  
Mina Kooklani, Event Chair  
Kristi Pieper, Co-Chair

**DATE:** Thursday, November 13<sup>th</sup> 2014

**LOCATION:** Hilton La Jolla Torrey Pines

**TICKETS/INFO:** [www.dressforsuccess.org/sandiego](http://www.dressforsuccess.org/sandiego)



For the past six years, **Leonard Simpson's 10 Best Dressed Awards** has received **rave reviews** as **one of San Diego's premier galas** with **unmatched style, experience** and **sold-out attendance!**

## THE EVENING'S HIGHLIGHTS

- 5:30pm Royal Red Carpet
- 7:00pm Formal seated dinner and Fashion Forward® Theatrical Show
- 8:00pm Live Auction & Music
- 8:30pm Awards Ceremony
- 9:00pm Dancing till Midnight



**"A Moment In Time" – Leonard Simpson's 10 Best Dressed Awards  
Celebration with a Purpose!**

## WE NEED YOUR SUPPORT! WHAT'S IN IT FOR OUR SPONSORS?

- Generate **goodwill!**
- Get great **community exposure!**
- **Extend** the reach of Dress for Success San Diego to 100's of disadvantaged women!
- **Visibility** throughout the **pre-event** promotional campaign, **during** the event, AND in **post-event** publicity!

Please consider sponsoring and attending this fantastic fundraising evening in support of **Dress for Success San Diego** and its mission to empower disadvantaged women to succeed in job interviews, thrive in the workplace, build careers and improve the quality of life for their families.



**Contact:** Marilyn O'Neill: [marilyn@dfssd.org](mailto:marilyn@dfssd.org); 858.587.7333 x204; Jennifer Myers: [jennifer@dfssd.org](mailto:jennifer@dfssd.org); 619.200.2639



## A Healthier Thanksgiving

Thanksgiving meals usually include an abundance of unhealthy food options, making it easy to stray from proper nutrition until the start of the new year. But if you opt for a healthy Thanksgiving meal instead, it doesn't mean it can't also be enjoyable. With a few changes, you can make your "Turkey Day" an extension of your year-round commitment to good health.

Begin with the elephant in the room: food. You can probably stand to forgo a luxury or two come turkey time. But don't worry; you can still enjoy a delicious meal with the added bonus of feeling much better afterward. Plus, Thanksgiving is just the start of the holiday season, so there will be a lot of large meals to come.

Start by having breakfast. While many

Americans make it a habit to wait to eat until the holiday meal is set out, eating a small meal in the morning can give you more control over your appetite, allowing you to be more selective in your food and beverage choices later on. Keep in mind that you can always have leftovers the next day.

When moving on to Thanksgiving's centerpiece—the turkey—be sure to go skinless. Just 1 ounce of turkey skin contains 80 calories and 2 grams of fat. Also, be sure to use fat-free chicken broth to baste the turkey and to make the gravy.

Next, turn your attention to the side dishes. Substituting skim milk or half-and-half for whole milk and cream in recipes is an obvious choice, as is omitting bacon and cheese from

any casseroles, but how about complementing these sides or ignoring them altogether in favor of steamed or roasted vegetables and cornbread?

If you must have a holiday favorite, make sure it is just that, and not something you consume regularly during the year. And be sure to police your portions, since there are definite consequences to having too much of a good thing.

Once you've made smarter choices regarding your turkey and your side dishes, you may be wondering if there is anything else you can do. There is!

Take a walk early in the day and then again after dinner. It is a wonderful way for families to get some physical activity and to enjoy the holiday together. For those who have the day off after Thanksgiving, plan an additional workout. You will feel like your old self in no time, ready to manage your diet and exercise regimen right away, instead of waiting until Jan. 1.

**Ebola is not a respiratory disease like the flu, so it is not transmitted through the air.**

## Ebola Outbreak Reaches U.S.

The recent deadly outbreak of Ebola in West Africa—the worst in history—has seized the world's attention, along with news that the virus has shown up in the United States.

Ebola is an acute viral illness characterized by the sudden onset of fever, debilitating weakness, muscle pain, headache and sore throat. People often confuse the illness' early symptoms with cold or flu symptoms.

Ebola is not a respiratory disease like the flu, so it is not transmitted through the air or through contaminated food or water. Ebola can only spread to other humans via contact with their bodily fluids, including saliva, sweat, blood and vomit, so people can only get Ebola from touching the bodily fluids of a person or animal that is sick with or has died from Ebola, or from exposure to contaminated objects, such as needles.

Though the Ebola outbreak has shown up in America, health officials have stressed repeatedly that the general public is at very low risk for contracting the virus, and they are instructing health workers on the proper precautions to take if they are called upon to treat an infected patient.

Provided by:  
**CAVIGNAC &  
ASSOCIATES**  
INSURANCE BROKERS

# Can You Really Boost Your Immunity?

As cold and flu season rolls around, there are a bevy of products you can turn to that purport to help boost your immunity. But how well do they actually work?

Since the function of the immune system is to react to challenges and develop new defenses, it can be improved. Every time you catch a cold or get vaccinated, your immune system builds a new army of killer T-cells, ready to fight off a future recurrence of the same pathogen.

But there is no nutritional supplement, superfood, or mind, body or spirit technique that will do this for you. Harvard Medical School has stated, “The concept of boosting immunity actually makes little sense scientifically. In fact, boosting the number of cells in your body—immune cells or others—is not necessarily a good thing,” and can lead to autoimmune disease in the case of your immune system.

So while you can’t supercharge your immune system, you can take precautions to prevent getting sick. These include practicing good hygiene (like regular hand-washing), getting vaccinated (including flu shots), practicing food safety, being knowledgeable and vigilant when traveling to foreign countries, drinking clean water and practicing safe sex.

# Lower Winter Fuel Costs



Budgeting money for the holidays is always important, but many people often forget about the increased energy costs associated with winter until they get hit with the bill. Use the following recommendations from the Department of Energy to keep your costs in check this year.

- Cover drafty windows with heavy-duty, clear plastic sheets, or tape clear plastic film to the inside of your window frames.
- Seal the air leaks around utility cut-throughs for pipes, in gaps around recessed lights in insulated ceilings and in unfinished spaces behind cupboards and closets.
- Maintain a regular service schedule for your heating systems. Replace filters once a month or as needed.
- Set your thermostat as low as is comfortable. Turning it back 10 degrees at night or before leaving your home can save around 10 percent of your heating bills.
- Finally, use LED holiday light strings to save on the price of seasonal decorations.



# Sweet Potato Casserole

Skip the marshmallows this year. This five-ingredient sweet potato casserole is low in fat and rich in flavor, and makes for a perfect side to complement your Thanksgiving meal.

- 2 tbsp. low-fat milk
- 1½ tsp. brown sugar
- 1 tsp. ground cinnamon
- ¼ cup quick cooking oats, dry
- 1 can low-sodium sweet potatoes, drained and chopped

Preheat oven to 350° F. In a small bowl, combine milk, brown sugar, cinnamon and oatmeal. Mix well and set aside. In a medium-sized baking pan, add the sweet potatoes so they cover the bottom of the pan. Add the oatmeal mixture on top of the sweet potatoes. Bake for 20 minutes. Serve hot, or refrigerate and serve cold.

Yield: 6 servings. Each serving provides 94 calories, 0.5g of fat, 0g saturated fat, 0mg of cholesterol, 30mg of sodium, 5g of sugar and 3g of fiber.

Source: USDA

© 2014 Zowee, Inc. All rights reserved.

# SPOTLIGHT ON



**Cavnac & Associates is proud to support local and non-profit civic organizations, including Mama's Kitchen.**



## **Mission**

At Mama's Kitchen they believe that everyone is entitled to the basic necessity of life — nutritious food. As a community-driven organization, they provide nutrition support to men, women, and children affected by AIDS or cancer who are vulnerable to hunger.

## **What They Do**

Mama's Kitchen delivers three nutritional meals a day, seven days a week at no charge to men, women and children living with AIDS or cancer. Additionally, Mama's Kitchen provides pantry services (Mama's Pantry) and nutrition education to people affected by AIDS. Through these services, they are able to provide food, compassion and hope to over 1,400 people annually living throughout San Diego County.

*For more information about Mama's Kitchen, go to [www.mamaskitchen.org](http://www.mamaskitchen.org)*